

Caledonia Township Planning Commission - DRAFT Special Meeting Minutes Public Hearing

Monday September 18, 2023 @ 6:30 pm

Caledonia Township Hall 6461 Gillard Rd. Spruce, MI 48762

- I. Call to Order: C. Dan LeClair presiding and called to order at 6:30pm
- II. Pledge of Allegiance - completed
- III. Roll Call: Sobeck-present, Morrell-present, LeClair-present, LaLonde-present, MacKinnon-absent
- IV. **Motion:** Sobeck to open Public Hearing for Special Land Use Request: SPU#1-2023
Applicant: AT&T Mobility c/o Haley Law Firm, PLC
Request: Special Land Use to Construct a 265' tower in a 75' x 75' fenced compound
Address: 2040 Spikehorn Trail, Hubbard Lake, Michigan
Seconded: Morrell. All in favor - **Motion passed**
- V. Applicant presentation: Wallace Haley, Haley Law Firm representing AT&T Mobility proposing 265 ft. cell tower on west shore of Hubbard Lake property owned by Mr. Apsey. Purpose to provide coverage to western side of lake.
- VI. Public Comment:

Karen Poellet: owns property north of the site. Not in favor of installation site. Too close to border of Alcona Township. How far is the coverage going? How was the site chosen? It should be serving more of Caledonia Township. Public Notification was not received. Dan LeClair reviewed ordinance requirements of public notification were met: Caledonia Review, Notice on Township Building, Pop up notice on Caledonia Website.

Lloyd Daggett: Bennett Road. knew nothing about it until he saw it on FB. very concerned about notification methods. Could there be a way on social media to broadcast notifications.

Brett Belesky: Hubbard Lake Mt. Maria. lives close to proposed site. Why building in the middle of a property zoned residential? Health concerns of radiation. Not in favor. Urge planning commission to look for a better location.

Diane Belesky: Hubbard Lake Mt. Maria. registered nurse. Health concerns of radiation. With so many miles of open land further away from residential property could another site be considered. She lives within 300 feet of proposed site. Please provide documentation of studies of how close is safe for a tower in a residential area. Light pollution concerns as well.

Joe Rhyme: looked at ordinance 9.25 where it states towers need to be no less than 3.0 miles between towers. What is the distance between current towers and proposed site? Concerns for health safety. With 9 miles of consolidated property could there be more distance put between tower and residential property. Is there possibility of using existing towers.

Ken Odea: 5800 Mt. Maria Rd. not opposed to tower. But strongly disagrees with the location.

Don Dollenger and brother Ron Dollenger: on Consolidated Board. manages the guard shack to Consolidated. Asking that they be notified of road usage. November 12-26 there is a guard on duty and would like to be contacted.

Pete Skiba: Mt. Maria Rd. does the planning commission make a recommendation to the Township Board or is the Planning Commission decision final. Dan LeClair, chairman, answered on special land use decisions the Planning Commission decision is final decision according to our current ordinance book. Question arose regarding Anthony Sobeck who sits on township board as well Planning Commission and how the votes are cast.

Wallace Haley: Haley Law Firm regarding health concerns the one thing the planning commission can not use in making their decision is health concerns due to Federal Law. the FCC mandates under the telecommunications act that the issue of health effects regarding cell towers is in the province of the federal government. Any evidence raised regarding health concerns can not be considered.

Joe Rhyme: Why isn't this tower being installed on township property so the township benefits from the income?

Morrell: read into minutes emails received on Planning Commission email:

Brent Belesky:

Please forward to all Members of the Planning Commission.

I am writing to express my strong opposition to the proposed installation of a new cell tower on Spikehorn Trail in Hubbard Lake, Michigan. While I understand the importance of

expanding cellular infrastructure to improve connectivity, I believe that this particular location is highly unsuitable for such a development.

Hubbard Lake is a cherished natural resource, known for its pristine beauty and tranquil surroundings. The community that surrounds the lake consists of families who have chosen to live in this area for its natural splendor and the peace it offers. The proposed cell tower installation would have several adverse effects on the local environment, community, and property values.

Environmental Impact: a. Hubbard Lake is home to diverse wildlife, and the proposed tower could disrupt local ecosystems and habitats. b. The visual impact of a tall cell tower in this scenic area would detract from its natural beauty and recreational appeal.

Health Concerns: a. Residents are understandably concerned about potential health risks associated with prolonged exposure to electromagnetic radiation from the tower. b. Studies on the long-term health effects of cell tower radiation are inconclusive, but this uncertainty creates anxiety among residents.

Property Values: a. The construction of a cell tower near residential areas typically leads to a decline in property values, impacting the financial well-being of homeowners. b. Reduced property values could have a cascading effect on the local economy and tax base.

Aesthetic and Cultural Impact: a. The proposed cell tower would be an eyesore in an area known for its natural beauty and recreational opportunities. b. The tower's presence could negatively impact the cultural and aesthetic character of the Hubbard Lake community.

I urge you to reconsider the location of this cell tower and explore alternative sites that would have fewer adverse effects on the environment, residents, and property values. The community around Hubbard Lake would be more supportive of a solution that balances the need for improved connectivity with the preservation of the natural beauty and well-being of our area.

I kindly request that you consider alternative sites for the cell tower installation. By doing so, you can ensure that any cellular infrastructure development in the Hubbard Lake area is both environmentally responsible and considerate of the community's concerns.

Thank you for your attention to this matter. I look forward to hearing from you and hope that we can work together to find a more suitable location for this project that respects the values and priorities of the Hubbard Lake community.

Sincerely,

Brent & Diane Belesky
5667 Mt. Maria Rd
Hubbard Lake, Michigan 49747
(313)819-6722

Julie Grubbs:

We have one concern with the new tower. We would like ATT to put it in writing that rates will not go up due to this structure going up. In past experience Verizon bills doubled in past counties.
Julie Grubbs

Todd Poellet:

I will be unable to attend Monday's meeting, but per our conversation I understand you will represent viewpoints received via email at that meeting...

Our family received the attached letter and are opposed to the location of this tower. We have two west-side lake-front homes and 600 acres across the road which will be impacted, and we seek to preserve the beauty of Hubbard Lake. We really don't want to look up at a cell tower and simultaneously across the lake at additional towers. The beauty of the east side shoreline has already been spoiled, why would we do the same to the west side? I'd propose putting this tower next to the other ones on the east side vs spoiling more of the area's beauty.

Thanks,
Todd Poellet / Poellet Family
5824 Mt Maria Rd

John Causble:

I received your contact information from close family friends Jason Roggenbuck and Todd Poellet. I have had the pleasure of being invited to enjoy their properties over the past few decades with them along the west shore of Hubbard Lake. As you are well aware, the area is second to none in its beautiful scenery. I share the same opinions with many on not wanting to spoil the view everyone loves with a new cell tower along the West Shore. Although I am not a current land owner in the area, it has been my goal to purchase land relatively close to the new tower location. Additional towers in the area will definitely have a negative impact on that decision. I am sure others seeking to enjoy unspoiled views would share the same opinion. Thank you for taking the time to consider this matter.

Marilyn Bachelor:

We disagree with placing another cell tower on west side of lake.
Marilyn Bachelor and Richard Bachelor
We would also like to say if tower can be lowered to eliminate the necessity for lights, we would approve it.

Lloyd Daggett:

There should be no discussion about this. Hubbard Lake has long been know for poor cell phone service. There is a need for this. If this tower is going where people have commented on the post in FB, I don't think it would be visible to anyone.

Lloyd Daggert

Susan Morgan:

I am in favor of placing a cell tower in the Consolidated Hunting.

Coverage needs to be extended. A reliable signal will help with emergency response, reliable signal, and provide an alternative cell phone competitor in the area.

Regards

Susan Morgan
734.812.4391

Kathy Osterman:

I am inquiring about the cell tower use permit on the West side of Hubbard Lake. I live at the corner of Mount Maria Rd. And Consolidated Rd. (Spike Horn). I am wondering what the exact location of the tower is. I have two concerns that I will address in the meeting tomorrow night:

- 1). Research show that cell towers should be located no less than 1/4 mile from residential areas due to the radiation that is omitted from the tower and its components. Will the tower be at least 1/4 mile from my home?
- 2). There is a "Fall Ordinance" in the county that no tower or structure will be placed in an area that, if it were to fall, it would not fall on another's

property. Will the tower be placed to ensure it is far enough from my home that it will meet the requirements of the fall ordinance?

If you can provide me this information prior to the meeting, that will be helpful.

Thank you,
Kathy Osterman/Denise Clingaman
5665 Mount Maria Rd
Hubbard Lake
(734) 709-5206

I pulled the ordinance last night and reviewed it. The map location is very helpful. As you know, the addresses out here can be a bit incorrect. 2040 Is showing much closer to the corner at Mount Maria Rd than the map you provided. So, knowing the location puts my mind at ease a bit. I am also counting on the Twp. enforcing the ordinance that the tower be approx 400 feet from any dwelling and 265 ft from the property line (using the setbacks used in the ordinance and height of proposed tower).

Again, thank you for the additional information. I absolutely support the project as long as it is at a safe distance from my property.

Kathy and Denise

VII. Sobeck made a Motion to adjourn at 7:11 pm. Seconded by LaLonde. All in favor - Motion passed.

respectfully submitted by Susie Morrell, Secretary Caledonia Planning Commission